

## **BOARD OF GOVERNORS**

### **HUMAN RESOURCES COMMITTEE**

1400, Thursday 17 May 2018, Board Room, Room 4.18, St Andrew's Court

#### **MINUTES**

Present: Margaret Scott, External Governor (Chair)  
Mark Greenwood, External Governor  
Jane Hoskins, External Governor  
Claudia Iton, External Governor  
Kathryn Land, Staff Governor  
Dr Patricia Shamai, Staff Representative  
Professor Mike Tipton, Staff Governor

Clerk: Annette Bourke, Head of Governance Services  
Jemma Keys, Senior Governance Officer

In attendance: Peter Brook, Director of Human Resources  
Helen Dunn, Deputy Director of HR & Organisational Development (for Min 36)  
Rebecca Hopkins, Deputy Director of HR (People Services) (Observer)  
James Ross, Equality and Diversity Information Coordinator (for Min 35)  
Dave Small, Equality and Diversity Manager (for Min 35)

#### **29. ELECTION OF CHAIR**

Margaret Scott left the meeting room whilst this item was discussed. The Head of Governance Services opened the meeting by inviting the election of the Chair for the 2018/2019 academic year. Margaret Scott, proposed by Professor Nairn Wilson, seconded by Claudia Iton, was re-elected unanimously as Chair of the Human Resources Committee.

#### **30. WELCOME, QUORACY, CONFLICT OF INTEREST AND APOLOGIES**

30.1 The Chair welcomed Rebecca Hopkins, Deputy Director of HR (People Services) to the meeting as an observer.

30.2 Apologies were received from External Governor: Nairn Wilson; Vice-Chancellor: Professor Graham Galbraith; Pro Vice-Chancellor: Professor Paul Hayes; and Director of Corporate Governance: Adrian Parry.

30.3 There were no interests declared. It was confirmed that the meeting was quorate and could proceed to business.

31 OUTCOME REPORTS – **confidential minute**

32 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

The minutes of the meeting held on 20 February 2018 were confirmed as an accurate record.

33 MATTERS ACTIONED AND MATTERS ARISING

33.1 Action was reported on two items for note; five items were to be covered later in the agenda; and two items were to be covered at a later meeting.

33.2 The Director of Human Resources provided an oral update on the review of the Grievance Procedure Appeals Process. The following points were noted:

- (i) An external consultant would be reviewing a number of the Human Resources policies and procedures. The Grievance Procedure would be included in this external review.
- (ii) There were a number of options that were under consideration to streamline the appeals process. One was to review and amend the current composition of the appeal panel. Another was to replace the appeal panel with an independent manager who would review the grievance appeal. A third option was discussed where a panel of governors could review the paperwork to provide assurance that the procedure had been conducted in an impartial and fair manner.
- (iii) It was suggested that external mediation could be incorporated as an additional mandatory stage in the Grievance Procedure. Mediation was available as a voluntary option under the current procedure and could be undertaken at any stage of the grievance process.
- (iv) It was important that line managers received training on identifying and managing the root causes of grievances.
- (v) A process flow chart outlining and comparing the current and proposed new Grievance Procedure once the review of the procedure had been completed would be provided to the Committee.

**Action: Director of HR**

33.3 Committee noted Annex 1 of the Matters Actioned paper which provided updates on the recommendations arising from the special meeting held on 19 January 2018. Recommendations would be removed from the paper once completed.

34 HUMAN RESOURCES COMMITTEE CONSTITUTION, MEMBERSHIP AND TERMS OF REFERENCE – AMENDMENT

Committee received the Human Resources Committee Constitution, Membership and Terms of Reference which had been amended at the request of the Committee. The following points were noted:

- 34.1 Committee agreed at its meeting on 20 February 2018 that succession and talent planning should be added to the Committee's terms of reference.
- 34.2 A further review of the appropriateness of the Committee's Constitution, Membership and Terms of Reference would be undertaken in September 2018, alongside a review of the Committee's business conducted in the academic year 2017/2018.
- 34.3 The revised Terms of Reference would be formally received by the Board of Governors at its meeting on 11 July 2018 for approval.
- 34.4 Committee agreed the amendment to the Terms of Reference as outlined in the agenda paper.

35 PEOPLE STRATEGY 2016 – 2020: UPDATE ON DELIVERY

Committee received a report from Peter Brook, Director of Human Resources that provided an update on the delivery of the People Strategy 2016 – 2020. The following points were noted in discussion:

- 35.1 HR Strategic Review: A Human Resources Review Steering Group had been established to oversee the implementation of the recommendations arising from the HR strategic review. The following points were noted:
  - (i) A priority for the Steering Group was to review and clarify the accountability and design principles for the senior structure of the Human Resources Department. The updated job profiles for senior roles would be submitted to the University Executive Board (UEB) for approval. The Committee would receive an update on the changes at a future meeting.
  - (ii) Other senior roles would be reviewed in the autumn with the new structure to be fully implemented by March 2019.
  - (iii) The implementation of the Voluntary Severance Scheme demonstrated the effectiveness of the changes already made as part of the strategic review. The Department had been required to respond quickly and effectively to ensure that the scheme was implemented by the required date.

- (iv) The responsibility for talent and succession management was currently shared between the senior members of staff across the Department. Consideration would be given to assigning the responsibility to one individual or team within the department.
- 35.2 Voluntary Severance Scheme: The University had been working in partnership with the trade unions UCU and UNISON on the introduction of a time limited Voluntary Severance Scheme (VSS). The following points were noted:
- (i) The scheme opened for applications from staff across the University on 1 May 2018. The closing date for applications was 8 June 2018.
  - (ii) Applications would be considered in light of the University's operational, business and strategic requirements and agreed by a specially convened panel chaired by the Vice-Chancellor.
  - (iii) Although some cost savings may be made as a result of the scheme, the overarching objective was to encourage an appropriate turnover of staff and to create flexibility for career progression and promotion.
  - (iv) A summary of the outcome of the scheme would be provided at a future meeting of the Committee.
- 35.3 Brexit: In light of the agreement between the UK and the EU on citizens' rights in December, the University held an open meeting for all staff on 14 March 2018. Alex Russell, an immigration lawyer from Mills and Reeve, delivered a talk on the details of the agreement including information on applications for permanent residence, settled status or British citizenship.
- 35.4 Apprenticeships: The University was making good use of its apprenticeship levy funds. There were three apprentice administrators working at the University and a further position was planned to be recruited in the Faculty of Science in the summer. Two apprentice laboratory technicians had been appointed in the Faculty of Science. The MBA Level 7 Strategic Leadership Degree Apprenticeship had been approved for delivery by the Institute for Apprenticeships (IfA). 15 members of staff had already been offered places and a further 10 places would be available for staff for September 2018. The HE Academic Professional Apprenticeship had also been approved for delivery by the IfA. The course would provide academic members of staff with a recognised transferable qualification and Higher Education Academy (HEA) membership. There were no concerns with regard to the expiry of funds.
- 35.5 Staff Survey: Five key themes had been identified from the survey which were performance; team work and working relationships; structures, roles and responsibilities; leadership and management; and managing change. A further

update on the staff survey would be received at the next meeting.

- 35.6 Athena Swan: Committee were pleased to note that the University had been awarded the Athena SWAN Bronze award. Members expressed their thanks and congratulations to Lesley Lee, the Equality and Diversity Team, Professor Matthew Weait, and all those who assisted in the drafting of the University's submission.
- 35.7 Performance Development Review (PDR) Pilot: The PDR Pilot had concluded in March 2018. A total of 77 per cent of staff in the pilot areas had completed their PDR by that time. An online form had been created and focus groups arranged to capture feedback on the pilot from participants. Initial feedback from participants noted that the length and complexity of the form should be reduced. Some participants found it challenging to identify a linkage between the University Strategy and individual objectives. Faculty and Professional Service strategies would be reviewed, strengthened and integrated into the process to provide greater linkage. Additionally, some reviewers found it difficult to challenge the self-assessment selected by reviewees as some objectives from previous years had not been clearly set and were difficult to measure. Committee suggested that, where appropriate, expectations set out in the relevant Staff Handbook should be linked to the PDR process to make clear to staff their responsibilities.
- 35.8 Key Performance Indicators (KPIs): The report provided an overview of the KPIs outlined in the University Strategy 2016 – 2020 for supporting and developing people. The roll out of the online PDR to all staff in the new academic year would enable the HR Department to capture data on the number of staff completing a PDR and their development opportunities. It was agreed that data from the staff survey should be used in the interim to provide an indication of the number of staff who felt able to access development opportunities. Members commented that a staff satisfaction target of 80% was a challenging target in the context of organisational and cultural change. The Committee agreed that it would continue to monitor the KPIs.

**Action: Director of HR**

## 36 STUDENT AND STAFF EQUALITY AND DIVERSITY DATA REPORTS 2016/2017

Committee received the Staff and Student Equality and Diversity Data Reports for 2016/2017 from Dave Small, Equality and Diversity Manager and James Ross, Equality and Diversity Information Coordinator. The following points were noted:

- 36.1 The Equality Act 2010 required the University to publish equality information annually, for both external and internal scrutiny.
- 36.2 The number of BME employees had increased by 12% and the number of members of staff with a declared disability had increased by 25% in 2016/2017,

when compared with 2015/2016. Improved levels of data recording amongst current members of staff was a factor in the increase in these numbers.

- 36.3 Tackling bias in the recruitment process was an area of focus for the next academic year. In 2016/2017, 15% of applications received for professional service roles were from BME applicants. 9% of shortlisted candidates were BME and 8% of the total job offers were to BME individuals.
- 36.4 Committee discussed initiatives to tackle potential bias in the recruitment process including the removal of personal information from application forms to ensure that an applicant could not be identified. Members noted that the University's online recruitment system would also be reviewed to ensure the application platform and process was clear and consistent for all applicants.
- 36.5 The Athena SWAN charter, run by the Equality Challenge Unit (ECU), had been successful in taking forward gender equality initiatives across the University. In 2016/2017, 55% of the core University workforce were female.
- 36.6 The University would be signing up to the ECU Race Charter in July 2018. The Charter aimed to improve the representation, progression and success of ethnic minority staff and students within Higher Education. The University would be required to develop and submit an action plan within three years of signing up to the Charter.
- 36.7 The ratio of students to academic members of staff, who shared the same characteristics was 23.9 to 1 for male BME students/staff, and 42.9 to 1 for female BME students/staff.
- 36.8 Overall, the BME 'good degree' attainment gap had decreased from 18.7% in 2015/2016 to 14% in 2016/2017. The national attainment gap was 15%.
- 36.9 Members agreed that, in the absence of an alternative reporting line, it was important that the Committee received the equality and diversity data for students on behalf of the Board of Governors. It was noted that the data was formally scrutinised at the Equality and Diversity Committee and at the Academic Council.
- 36.10 The Equality and Diversity objectives for 2018 – 2020 outlined the key targets for the University. There were aspirations to develop and strengthen the objectives in future years through the addition of Key Performance Indicators (KPIs).
- 36.11 Committee were encouraged by the initiatives and agreed that it should continue to be regularly updated on progress.
- 36.12 Committee approved for publishing the Staff Equality and Diversity Data Report for 2016/2017 and noted the Student Equality and Diversity Data Report for

2016/2017.

## 37 GENDER PAY GAP

Committee received a report from Helen Dunn, Deputy Director of Human Resources and Organisation Development that provided information on the University's Gender Pay Gap for 2016/2017 and the proposed approach for ongoing pay reporting. The following points were noted in discussion:

- 37.1 The University published its Gender Pay Gap report by the deadline 31 March 2018. The headline Pay Gap figures were available on the Government website and a more detailed report was available on the University website.
- 37.2 The Gender Pay Gap figures were calculated using the Equality Challenge Unit (ECU) methodology and was based on HESA data. This form of methodology enabled benchmarking of results against the Higher Education (HE) sector and the wider economy average.
- 37.3 The University's mean pay gap for 2016/2017 was 14.7% which was just below the HE sector figure of 14.8% and lower than the wider economy figure of 17.4%. The University's median pay gap for 2016/2017 was 23.3% which was higher than the median sector figure of 15.6% and the wider economy figure of 18.4%.
- 37.4 In 2016/2017, approximately 24% of members of staff in professorial roles at the University were female and 76% were male. This was a sector wide issue and steps were being taken to address the gap.
- 37.5 The paper proposed that further work should be undertaken to review the potential scope of an Equal Pay Review, in line with the Joint Negotiating Committee for Higher Education Staff (JNCHEs) guidelines. The Equal Pay Review would supplement the University's annual Gender Pay Gap report and would provide a detailed analysis on the pay gap data.
- 37.6 The Committee endorsed the proposed approach of an Equal Pay Review and noted the Gender Pay Gap report.

## 38 REPORT FROM THE DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES

Committee received the regular report from Peter Brook, Director of Human Resources. The following points were noted in discussion:

- 38.1 Academic Promotions: The Reader and Professor Promotion round was conducted on an annual basis. Applications for promotion were reviewed by two Faculty Promotion Committees, before final consideration by a University-wide

promotions panel. Faculties were responsible for encouraging members of staff to apply for Reader and Professor promotions.

- 38.2 Organisational Change: Three faculties were in the process of restructuring. The changes would be implemented for the start of the next academic year.
- 38.3 Pay 2018/2019: The University was participating in the annual pay negotiations conducted through the New Joint Negotiating Committee for Higher Education Staff (JNCHES). The employers had offered a final pay increase of 2% with a higher pay uplift for lower paid members of staff. The Unions would be consulting their members on the pay offer in mid-June. Committee agreed to provide delegated authority to the Chair to approve implementation of the employers' final pay offer.
- 38.4 Occupational Health: The Interim Occupational Health Manager would leave the University in June 2018. A new interim Occupational Health Manager would be recruited to allow time for the permanent role to be further considered and re-advertised.
- 38.5 Part Time Hourly Paid (PTHP) Settlement: Following the endorsement of the settlement by University and College Union (UCU) members, the agreed settlement had been fully implemented. The HR Department would be reviewing the terms outlined in the contracts for PTHP members of staff.

## 39 HEALTH AND SAFETY

- 38.1 Committee received and noted the Health and Safety quarterly report for the period February 2018 to April 2018 including reported accidents and training statistics. The following points were noted in discussion:
- (i) It would be helpful for the quarterly report to highlight the key issues that the Committee should be aware of. It would also be beneficial for the Committee to receive a horizon scanning update outlining new procedures and policies that may affect the University.  
**Action: Interim Health and Safety Manager**
  - (ii) There had been a reduction in the number of accidents from February to April 2018, when compared to the same period last year. This was due to the Department's efforts of ensuring that appropriate health and safety practices were fully embedded across the University.
  - (iii) There were no issues to report with regards to drug and substance abuse. The University's Wellbeing Service provided vital support to students.

38.2 Committee noted that a soft copy of the draft minutes from the Health and Safety Committee held on 28 March 2018 were circulated electronically to members on 4 May 2018.

#### 39 CONFIRMED MEETING DATES FOR 2018/2019

The following meeting dates were confirmed at the meeting on 20 February 2018:

- Tuesday, 25 September 2018 from 1400 to 1600
- Tuesday, 4 December 2018 from 1400 to 1600
- Tuesday, 26 February 2019 from 1400 to 1600
- Tuesday, 21 May 2019 from 1400 to 1600

#### 40 INDICATIVE COMMITTEE BUSINESS

Committee received and noted that the indicative committee business for 2018/2019. Members noted that the paper was a working document and subject to change.

#### 41 DELEGATED AUTHORITY

Committee agreed to delegate authority to the Chair of the Human Resources Committee to take action on any matters arising before the next meeting.

#### 42 DATE OF NEXT MEETING

The next meeting would be held on Tuesday 26 September 2018 at 1400.

#### 43 THANKS

This was the last meeting of the Human Resources Committee for Staff Governors: Professor Mike Tipton and Kathryn Land; and Staff Representative: Dr Patricia Shamai. The Chair expressed her thanks to Mike, Kathryn and Patricia for their significant contributions to the Committee and wished them well in their future endeavours.